



64TH (LXIV) DPCG MEETING MINUTES

Date: Tuesday, 13th, December, 2016

Time: 9:00 -12:00 am

Venue: MINECOFIN (Ground Floor) Conference Room

Development Partners Coordination Group (DPCG)

Minutes

1. Remarks by Chair and Co-Chairs

The Chair of the Development Partners Coordination Group (DPCG) and Permanent Secretary and Secretary to the Treasury (PS/ST), Mr. Caleb Rwamuganza opened the meeting and welcomed all participants and gave a warm welcome to all the Development Partners and Government officials in the meeting. The Chair thanked everyone for their achievements and thanked the DPs for their disbursements. The Chair said he looked forward to the discussion and introduced the co-chairs (The World Bank Chief Country Manager for Rwanda, Yasser El-Gammal and Lamin Maneh, UN Resident Coordinator. The Chair also reminded everyone that this was the last DPCG meeting of 2016.

Mr El- Gammal expressed his appreciation, as co-chair for the first time, to all the good work that is happening as well as express his thanks to The Chair and Ronald Nkusi, Director of External Finance, MINECOFIN. The co-chair conceded that there have been difficult times in the region and congratulated the government on the prudent way that they have been dealing with pressures such as the commodity crisis, the refugee crisis among other factors. The WB also spoke about the recent IMF mission where Rwanda is delivering on all of its commitments, appreciated the work that has been done in creating the agenda for the DPCG.

The UN RC, Mr Maneh welcomed the presentations on social protection strategy as a government priority and expressed his support, as part of the DP group for the harmonized and collective capacity building initiatives. The co-chair also conveyed his appreciation for the backward looking JSR and looked forward to hearing findings of the SPIU capacity assessment taskforce. Regarding global issues, Mr. Maneh welcomed Rwanda's renewed commitment to combat forced displacement and praised the President for being one of the few to be invited to President's Obama's Leader Summit.

The UNRC thanked Ms. Laura Beaufile and Marcia Musisi Nkambwe for their strong leadership roles. Regarding Macro-economic challenges, the Co-Chair recognized that in the face of difficulties Rwanda continues to improve and recognize the all-important problem of the current account deficit. Mr. Maneh acknowledged that this discrepancy is due to global declining commodity prices and reduction in mining and appreciated the efforts that have been made to closing this gap through projects such as Made In Rwanda. Mr Maneh also expressed his anticipation for Vision 2050 and EDPRS3 and voiced his hope that Rwanda maintain an open minded approach to the issue of refugees and their integration.

2. Approval of the draft minutes of the previous DPCG

The minutes of the 63rd DPCG meeting were approved without any amendments.

3. Review of 2016 DPR agreed actions

Mr. Ronald Nkusi, Director of the External Finance Unit, MINECOFIN began the presentation by welcoming everyone and reminding the participants that there were 30 recommendations that were clustered around 7 issues. The recommendations, issues and their current statuses are outlined below:

Issue 1: Improved implementation capacities and engagement in local communities in projects

Recommendation 1: Pool funding in order to ensure long-term TA for SPIUs (esp. in areas such as contract management, procurement and project preparation, environmental and social impact assessments) - Status: On-going

Recommendation 2: Develop and roll-out a single SPIU Project Management Framework and Training around it.

Issue 2: Planning Instruments, Priorities and SDGs domestication

Recommendation 3: Circulate the EDPRS2 MTR and organize a discussion on its findings. – Status: On-going

Recommendation 4: Disseminate the SDGs initial gap analysis report and pursue phase 2 of the gap analysis at the sector level through forward looking JSRs. – Status: Met

Recommendation 5: Define better capacity building support for CSOs and provide support for the effective engagement in the SDGs domestication process. – Status: On-going

Issue 3: Private Investment and Economic Growth

Recommendation 6: Benchmark progress in competitiveness and productivity of the private sector against best performers in the region and continue to re-fine institutional set up for investment and export growth promotion. -Status: On-going

Recommendation 7: Develop financing options for SMEs and export businesses (incl. blended financing mechanisms) -Status: On-going

Recommendation 8: Define a clear investment roadmap and consolidate the investment and after-care service. -Status: On-going

Issue 4: Improve nutrition outcomes in Rwanda

Recommendation 9: GoR to define level of nutrition coordination structure and the role, responsibilities and composition of a full-time nutrition secretariat/mechanism in support of inter-agency coordination – status: met

Recommendation 10: Undertake analysis of available funding and gaps for nutrition outcomes in the mid-term (FY16/17 – FTY 18/19) and develop a Nation Action Plan and financing plan based on analysis. – Status: met

Issue 5: SWGs and JSR Calendar

Recommendation 11: The recommendations proposed by the Joint Technical Team were endorsed with the exception of the one regarding the setting up of Sub-SWGs on Planning and Budgeting. Each SWG to implement recommendations, including functions of SSWG on Planning/Budgeting and report back to DPCG – Status: on-going

Issue 6: New DPAF

Recommendation 12: Set up a joint team (GoR and 3-5 volunteer DPs) to work on new DPAF indicators.

Issue 7: DPs Joint Commitments

Recommendation 13: DPs to report progress in implementing their joint commitments made at 2016 DPR

4. Presentation on Macro-economic updates by Chief Economist Mr. Leonard Rubwabiza

The Chief Economist began with the real sector for the first half 2016 where GDP grew by 6.5%. Industry was dragged down by mining shrinking for the third semester in a row, mainly due to some large construction projects (e.g. Convention Centre) coming to an end.

Rwandan economy overview and mid-term projections: Agriculture growth expected to grow from 6.0% in 6.2% in 2017; Industry from 4.6% to 9.2%; and Services expected to decline from 8.6% to 6.3%.

Inflation: Chief Economist indicated that we have seen the highest inflation in the last 10 years – a rate of 7.4%. This is due to a combination of a poor harvest and some pass-through from exchange rate depreciation; However this does not appear to be a general phenomenon, with inflation for goods that are neither imported nor fresh only increasing by about 3.5%. Inflation is projected to average 5.6% in 2016.

External Sector: Expecting shock on commodity prices, fortunately this year Rwanda benefitted from a positive shock on oil so the volume of imports went down. Mr. Rubwabiza stressed that in order to address BOP Rwanda must reduce demand for imports in the short term while in the medium term increase supply. Rwanda is fostering growth and imports replacement through a 'Made In Rwanda' campaign. Areas of concern include construction, manufacturing industries, textiles and garments.

External Sector outlook: The Current Account is expected to deteriorate further in 2016, before strengthening in the Medium Term. Foreign reserves will be maintained between 3-5-4 months of imports in 2016-2017.

Monetary Sector: Credit to private sector increased by 30.0% in Dec 2015 and by 12.2% by October 2016. RwF currency depreciated end-of November 2016 against the USD by 9.3% from Dec 2015

Monetary Sector (outlook): Private sector credit is expected to grow by 13.8% in 2016 and 16.5% in 2017 as monetary policy is tighter than it was in 2015. Headline inflation is projected to be contained at 5% in the MT. The main risks to monitor: the depreciation of the FRW against the USD and agricultural products. The exchange rate will remain market driven and NBR will continue to allow greater exchange rate flexibility and ensure reserve levels remain comfortable.

Fiscal Sector: Lower fiscal deficit than projected in 15/16 and remain controlled in MT. Higher revenue than projected due to increased income tax receipts, higher VAT collection due to expanded use of EBM and greater import receipt from non-EAC countries due to depreciation against their currencies. Chief Economist reminded the meeting that Rwanda has negotiated with IMF to catch up on the excess budget cut that happened in 2015.

Main risks to monitor: Trend of international oil prices, strengthening of dollar against the FRW(public debt becoming more expensive), FED decision to lift interest rates , agriculture performance

Mr Rugwabiza reassured the co-chair and participants that although the airport will be part of deficit, it will be funded through increased revenue. Mr Rugwabiza reminded the meeting that the airport is part of the national strategy to grow MICE through Rwanda Air and the International Convention Centre. Leonard noted that the only reason Rwanda has not constructed the airport earlier was because they are in the middle of negotiating sustainable financing which will be made up of 75% government and 25% private sector.

5. Update on the process and timeline for development of the Vision 2050 and EDPRS3

Mr. Godfrey Kabera, Director General of National Development Planning and Research presented on the JSR findings and representations & Vision 2050 and EDPRS 3 Process and Timeline. Mr. Kabera stressed that the Backward looking JSR work is a continuous process and there is need for more public discussions to see the kind of targets that Rwanda might aspire to by 2050. Mr Kabera said that that forums will be set up by various members of the community to be able to contribute to different sectors and the plan is to finalize EDPRS3 and Vision 2050 by next year's National Dialogue. A detailed concept note will be submitted in due course.

Key findings from 2015/2016 BL JSRs

Recommendations

- Institutions should prioritize the implementation of catch up plans
- To improve the quality of JSR process and enhanced stakeholders coordination there is need to conduct Joint monitoring visits. (No sector used this approach)

Way Forward

- The JSR priorities will inform the 2017/18 planning process
- The findings on implementation will be important for the strategic planning process (EDPRS 2 Evaluation, EDPRS 3 Formulation, Vision 2050)

Vision 2050 – Process and Timeline

- December 2016: Presentation of broad lines in National Dialogue Council
- January 2017: Continued consultations with general public and different stakeholder groups + wider communication process
- February 2017: Presentation of 1st Draft in National Leadership retreat
- March to November 2017: Further consultation with different stakeholders and drafting of the Vision Document
- December 2017: Presentation Final draft Vision 2050 at National Dialogue

EDPRS 3 Process and Timeline

- December 2016: Recruitment of firm to undertake external EDPRS 2 mid-term evaluation (MINECOFIN)
- January 2017: Conduct EDPRS 2 mid-term evaluation (Consulting firm)
- February 2017: Presentation of findings of preliminary mid-term evaluation to DPR
- March to November 2017: Elaboration of draft EDPRS 3 Document (Fully integrating SDGs, Agenda 2063, EAC Vision 2050); Elaboration of SSPs, DDPs; Consultations & communication; Costing & Strategy document drafting; Conducting validation workshops in different fora
- December 2017: Approval of final EDPRS3 document by Cabinet

Areas for collaboration

- In the elaboration of EDPRS 3 and Vision 2050; Development of SSPs / DDPs and SDGs Domestication :

- Development and execution of Outreach and Communication Strategy
- Analytical Works to inform Sector Strategies and Districts Development Plans formulation
- Supporting the Integration of SDGs into SSPs and DDPs
- Development of Sector Strategic Plans and District Development Plans
- Identifying new resources to scale up results in line with SDG ambitions

The ADB Resident Representative commended the steps that have been taken but reminded the Chief Economist that although reducing demand is the right measure to reduce Current Account Deficit, he stressed that this is only *short term* solution and that long term increases in supply requires much deeper thinking. Mr. Makonnen stressed that GoR and DPs have a role to play in redirecting investment from low value to high value activities.

Mr Rugwabiza agreed with the Co-Chair and reminded him that there have been many long term investments, including the Bugasera International Airport which have served to increase the long term supply. Leonard stated that the feasibility study for the airport was completed years ago and that before they invest in such activities they conduct a DSA (Debt Sustainability Analysis) study first.

The IMF representative Mr. Allun Thomas noted that there is a difference between the rate of urban inflation (9%) and rural inflation (10.6%) which underlines the importance of combatting the rise in food prices as well as pushing on foreign exchange constraint.

The Chief Economist agreed and said that there has been a push to add value to traditional exports. Mr. Rugwabiza used the example of coffee washing stations and value addition in mining as a way of combatting the CA deficit. Regarding inflation being higher in the urban sectors than the rural sectors, the chief economist described how when the agricultural sector does not do well, rural producers tend to sell to the urban market in arrears which inflates the price even further.

1. Social Protection Policy (With focus on the restructuring of the UBUDEHE categories).

The PS for MINALOC Ms. Odette Uwamariya expressed her thanks to the meeting and her gratitude in taking part. The PS began the presentation with explaining Social Protection Policy as the '*set of public and private initiatives that provide **income or consumption transfers** to the poor, **protect the vulnerable against livelihood risks***'.

The PS explained the Legal and Policy Framework for Social Protection in Rwanda and the driving force behind the development of Rwanda's social protection system. The PS made special mention in taking special measures for the welfare of the needy survivors of the 1994 genocide against Tutsi' and promoting welfare of people living with disabilities;

The PS provided an update on the Scope of Social Protection National Social Protection Strategy (NSPS) 2013-2018; the UBUDEHE categorization in social context.

Ms. Uwamariya explained the restructuring of the UBUDEHE categories: In 2015, nationwide Ubudehe Categorization was implemented by MINALOC through LODA in partnership with Local Governments and other technical ministries.

2015 Ubudehe categorization based on information provided in regard to:

- Household Characteristics;
- Basic needs information;
- Hygiene and sanitation conditions;
- Household equipment;
- Agriculture and livestock production potential;
- Income information ;
- Information on Health and health promotion;
- Social inclusion measurement.

The Challenges that the PS identified for categorization include:

- Speculative tendencies around the Ubudehe categories which are tied closely with Government benefits deviated some people from real category to lower echelon categories.
- Inclusion and exclusion errors (some people found themselves in inappropriate categories due to inaccuracy of information provided during categorization process).

The PS mentioned that in order to move forward MINALOC needs to:

- Review of ubudehe data every three years and when deemed necessary (i.e: In case of natural disaster calamities that bring shocks to any household).
- Automation of the ubudehe data through the introduction of “Management Information System” to manage and update data on regular basis.
- Increase awareness of community members on Categorisation as well as the targeting policies.
- Reinforce the local government involvement and ownership.
- Integrated Civil Society in Ubudehe categorization processes.
- Improve the Household classification criteria to make them more smarter.

Comments needed on Social Policy – which questions were asked?

6. Update on SPIU assessment key findings and way-forward

Mr Musobo (Consultant) presented the preliminary findings of an assessment of the functioning of Single Project Implementation Units (SPIUs). The consultant explained in detail the objective of the assignment; the background of SPIU policy; the background and context and the current SPIU status.

The number of SPIU’s vary from ministry to ministry and carry out project management functions including:

1. Project planning (feasibility studies, design, appraisal, ..)
2. Project management (implementation, M&E, budgeting, tendering, reporting, closing) etc.

Mr. Musobo mentioned a number observed strengths of SPIUs including:

- The SPIU structure is delivering on project implementation
- Projects' transaction costs have been reduced thru shared functions
- Staff retention has been enhanced
- Coordination of projects has been enhanced
- Planning , monitoring and implementation of projects has improved
- Budgeting and disbursement performance has been enhanced
- Synergies between different projects within a program have been enhanced
- Project M&E and reporting has improved

Areas for improvement include:

Project management framework:

- Project management tools and procedures need to be developed and harmonized;
- The relationship between lead Ministries, SPIUs in implementing entities, MINECOFIN and DPs need to be clearly defined to enhance ownership and coordination of projects;
- Need to develop sector synergies for instance some sectors have SPIUs that seem quite disjointed (Some projects in certain sectors are still implemented outside the SPIU framework);
- Operationalization of steering committees where they are absent, strengthen where they exist and harmonize their function

Capacity building:

- Strengthen expertise within the PMMU to enhance their project monitoring capacity;
- Adopt a systematic approach to CD including development of harmonized project management tools and procedures (GIZ project is supporting an element of this)
- Institutionalize approach to CB in SPIUs and support training of SPIU staff in recognized professional certification programs (preferably in-country)

MINECOFIN oversight function:

- PMMU currently has 1 Director and 6 staff monitoring 309 projects implemented by Central Gov and 492 by Local Gov,
- It was previously under the National Budget Directorate but moved in 2015 to National Planning Directorate with the objective to strengthen linkage b/n project planning, execution (qualitative and quantitative) and M&E,
- Operationalize as soon as possible, the cabinet decision reached last week to strengthen PMMU by making it a division with 2 specialists and 8 staff and enhancement of LODA structure to improve monitoring of decentralized projects

Way Forward:

- Finalize and circulate the assessment report for review and final comments from stakeholders within 7 days
- Finalize the CB plan and related roadmap within 7 days
- Develop the project management framework before commencement of the next financial year (2017/18)

After the floor was open for comments, DFID Head of Office Ms Laura Beaufils commented on whether there was double payment of SPIU employees and asked about the mismatch between the number of SPIU staff and number of employees. Additionally, DPs argued that there needs to be a joint effort to reduce the number of 'stand-alone' projects who do not involve SPIUs.

PS of MIFOTRA ... Explained that there is no chance that SPIU staff would be double paid because of the system that is in place (employees must provide details such as the social security number etc. in order to be paid) and therefore there is no chance that an SPIU could be double paid. Regarding the mismatch between number of SPIU staff and number of employees, the PS argued that the system is designed in way that sometimes requires more SPIU staff to be needed in specific projects than others. The PS reiterated that this is not a cause for concern and that usually the number of SPIU staff is in line with government staff.

7. Presentation on refugees situation

The UNHCR Representative Mr. Saber Azam began the presentation outlining the arrival periods of refugees in Rwanda:

Key challenges:

- Insecurity in countries of origin
- Environment protection
- Insufficient assistance (Food variety, Cloths, hygienic items, ...)
- Shift of attention to refugees in Middle East
- Land availability in Rwanda
- Camps establishment
- Camps in proximities of countries of origin
- Livelihood

Possible solutions

- Encourage the ongoing peaceful negotiations
- Energy saving stoves, use of peat, cooking gas
- Livelihood strategy including cash provision
- Relocation of Burundian refugees

The DPs commended the work that Rwanda has been doing in tackling the refugee crisis and promised to offer moresupport towork towards resolving the issue. Ms Beaufils congratulated GoR leadership in being a progressive home for refugees and highlighted the opportunity, on the back of the Obama summit – for Rwanda to be a thought leader and program demonstrator in handling the influx of refugees. .

8. Review of DPR Agenda

After a brief review of the DPR Agenda it was decided that any suggestions for improvements should be sent in to the chair, rather than discussed on the day.

9. AOB

With no AOB issues , the meeting was adjourned.

The Chair closed the meeting by congratulating the DPs and his colleagues in government for their hard work and wishing everyone a happy holidays.

Annex 1: List of Participants

Annex 2: PowerPoint Presentations

Names	Position	Institution	Telephone	Email
Mushabe Richard	Director of Planning & Monitoring	MINECOFIN	0788708158	Richard.Mushabe@minecofin.gov.rw
J.P. De Margere	Director	WFP	0788306741	Jean-pierre.Margere@wfp.org
Nama Heltberg	Exterior. Rel officer	UNHCR	0787168118	heltberg@unhcr.org
Hyeong Lae Cho	CD	KOICA	0788309295	hlcho@koica.go.kr
Jeyun Choi	Deputy Country Director	KOICA	0788380112	choijeyun@koica.go.kr
Mikio Masaki	Program Advisor	JICA	0788304705	Masaki.mikio@jica.go.jp
Shinichi Sakuma	Coordinator for Economic Cooperation	Japanese Embassy	0729004408	Shinichi.sakuma-3@mofa.go.jp
Kim Sohyeon	Political & Economic Analyst	Embassy of Korea	0788317102	Shkim16@mofa.go.kr
Sara Haglund	1 st Sec	Embassy of Sweden	0788301909	Sara.haglund@gov.se
Saori Kishi	Pol & Econ. Officer	Embassy of Japan	0788385403	Saori.kishi@mofa.go.jp
Stephen Rodriques	Country Director	UNDP	0782220020	Stephen.rodriques@undp.org
Markus Bar	Office Director	KFW	0788300101	Markus.baer@kfw.de
Bodo Immink	Country Director	GIZ	0788301516	Bodo.immink@giz.de
Charlotte Taylor	PFM advisor	BTC	0788361606	Charlotte.taylor@btcctb.org
Ted Maly	REP	UNICEF		tmaly@unicef.org
George Deso	Head RCO	UHRC		George.deso@one.un.org
Yasser El- Gammal	Country Manager	World Bank	0788304363	yelgammal@worldbank.org
Lamin Manneh	UNRC	UN/UNDP	0782220001	Lamin.manneh@one.un.org
Negatu Makonnen	AfDB	Resrep	0788305388	n.makonnen@afdb.org
Johan Cauwenbergh	EU	Head of Cooperation	0788308380	Johan.cauwenbergh@eeas.europa.eu
Laura Beaufils	Head of DFID, Rwanda	DFID	0788357458	l.beaufils@dfid.gov.uk
Marcia Musisi Nkambwe	Mission Director	USAID	0787396121	Mmusisi-nkambwe@usaid.gov
Bya	Consultant	Individual	0788899225	musobo@gmail.com
Leonard Rugwabiza	Chief Economist	MINECOFIN	0788860010	Leonard.rugwabiza.gov.rw
Godfrey Kabera	DG National Planning	MINECOFIN	0788478597	Godfrey.kabera@minecofin.gov.rw
Murora Beth	DG/Supreme Court	Supreme Court	0788312865	Beth.murora@judiciary.gov.rw
Habimana Jean Damascene	SG/NPPA	NPPA	0788307508	Damascene.habimana@nppa.gov.rw
Antonia Mutore	DG	CESB	0788301163	mutoreanto@unica
Isabelle kalihanbago	PS	MINIJUST	0788307919	

Byamukama Bemis	Economist	AfDB	0788627839	b.byamukama@afdb.org
Shema Murangira	Division Manager CB Sector Support	CESB	0788302177	Shemamurangira@ncbs.gov.rw
Amina Rwakunda	Senior Economist	MINECOFIN	0788500525	Amina.rwakunda@minecofin.gov.rw
Michel M. Sebera	EDF/NAO Manager	SPIU/ MINECOFIN	0788415515	Michel.sebera@minecofin.gov.rw
Gaizinza Justine	Division Manager SPILODA/MINATRE	LODA/MINATRE	0788307442	Gaizinzijustine57@gmail.com
Ryutaro Murotani	Senior Representative	JICA	0788301725	Murotani.ryutaro@jica.go.jp
Saber Azam	Representative	UNHCR	0788316616	azam@unhcr.org
Alun Thomas	Representative	IMF	0788302701	athomas@imf.org
Giqucando Delicciotto	HoC	SDC	0788302532	dpg@eda.admin.de
Mikael Bostoom	HoC	Embassy of Sweden	0788300725	Mikael.bostoom@gov.se
Lee Dong Kiu	DCM	Embassy of Korea	0781883876	Dkulee09@mofa.kr
Masaya Sagawa	DCM	Embassy of Japan	0788385401	Masaya.sagawa@mofa.go.jp
Odette Uwamariya	PS	MINALOC		

